

1 TIFFANY N. NORTH, State Bar No. 228068
County Counsel, County of Ventura
2 MARINA PORCHE, State Bar No. 162809
Assistant County Counsel
3 800 South Victoria Avenue, L/C #1830
Ventura, California 93009
4 Telephone: (805) 654-2583
Facsimile: (805) 654-2185
5 E-mail: marina.porche@venturacounty.gov

6 Attorneys for Defendants County of Ventura and
Ventura County Animal Services
7

8 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
9 CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
WESTERN DIVISION

10
11 SANTA PAULA ANIMAL RESCUE)
CENTER, INC. AND CLAIRE)
12 BIRGY, THE GUARDIANS OF)
CANINE COMPANION BRUCE,)

13 Plaintiffs,

14 vs.

15
16 VENTURA COUNTY, VENTURA)
COUNTY ANIMAL SERVICES,)
17 CITY OF OXNARD AND DOES 1-)
10,)

18 Defendants.

No. 2:26-cv-05196 SSG (Ex)

19)
20)
21)
22)
23)
24)
25)
26)
27)
28)
OPPOSITION BY DEFENDANTS
COUNTY OF VENTURA AND
VENTURA COUNTY ANIMAL
SERVICES TO PLAINTIFFS'
EMERGENCY EX PARTE
APPLICATION FOR TEMPORARY
RESTRAINING ORDER AND
ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE RE
PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION

Date: May 15, 2026
Time: 8:30 a.m.
Ctrm: 5C, 5th Floor
Judge: Sherilyn Peace Garnett

Complaint filed: May 14, 2026

21 Defendants County of Ventura and Ventura County Animal Services
22 (“Defendants”) are currently subject to the April 15, 2026, order of Ventura
23 County Superior Court Judge Mark S. Borrell, which requires compliance within
24
25
26
27
28

1 30 days of April 15, 2026.^{1/}

2 Defendants oppose the emergency ex parte application of plaintiffs Santa
3 Paula Rescue Center, Inc. and Claire Birgy (“Plaintiffs”) for a temporary
4 restraining order and order to show cause re preliminary injunction.

5 The timeline of key facts and events shows that Ventura County Animal
6 Services has complied with applicable law set forth in Ventura County Ordinance
7 Code sections 4470 through 4470-18 relating to potentially dangerous and vicious
8 dogs,^{2/} after the dog Bruce bit multiple persons.

9 Contrary to the moving papers, Plaintiff Claire M. Birgy was served with
10 the 89 pages of documents supporting the moving Petition for the administrative
11 hearing and her counsel was served with a Petition, with the same 89 pages of
12 supporting documents, in connection with the Ventura County Superior Court’s
13 appeal hearing held on April 15, 2026.

14 Jean Marie Webster, the Chief Executive Officer of Plaintiff Santa Paula
15 Animal Rescue Center, Inc., attended and spoke during the administrative hearing
16 held on March 25, 2026 which resulting in a hearing officer order determining the
17 dog Bruce to be vicious.

18 Being aware of the pending vicious dog proceedings against the dog Bruce,
19 if Plaintiff Santa Paula Animal Rescue Center wanted to assert that it was Bruce’s
20 actual owner, and that a Petition should have been served and filed against Santa
21 Paula Animal Rescue Center as the true party in interest in both the administrative
22 hearings and in the Ventura County Superior Court, Plaintiff Santa Paula Animal
23 Rescue Center was free to file the appropriate papers in Ventura County Superior
24

25 ^{1/} A copy of the April 15, 2026, order is attached hereto as Exhibit 1, along
26 with a subsequent Minute Order dated May 6, 2026, modifying the April 15, 2026,
order by striking paragraph 8 in its entirety, are attached as Exhibit 1.

27 ^{2/} Ventura County Ordinance Code provisions were modeled on California
28 Food and Agricultural Code sections 31601 through 31681.

1 Court, but never did.

2 There is no good cause to support the ex parte application for a temporary
3 restraining order and order to show cause re preliminary injunction as to
4 defendants the County of Ventura and Ventura County Animal Services.

5

6

TIMELINE OF KEY FACTS AND EVENTS

7

8 * The City of Ventura contracts with the County of Ventura for field
9 services to be provided by Ventura County Animal Services, and has
10 incorporated by reference the Ventura County Ordinance Code provisions
11 pertaining to potentially dangerous and vicious dogs set forth in Ventura
12 County Ordinance Code section 4470 through 4470-18.

13

14 * The City of Oxnard does not contract with the County of Ventura for field
15 services to be provided by Ventura County Animal Services and adheres to
16 the City of Oxnard Ordinance Code provisions pertaining to potentially
17 dangerous and vicious dogs.

18

19 * Between February 1, 2024 – February 7, 2026, there were four incidents
20 involving the dog Bruce biting three victims and one additional person
21 being knocked down by the dog Bruce; two of the victims were located in
22 the City of Ventura and two of the victims were located in the City of
23 Oxnard.

24

25 * On March 12, 2026, Ventura County Animal Services Senior Animal
26 Control Officer Alina Hoffman personally delivered two separate packets
27 containing notice of an administrative hearing to be held March 25, 2025,

28

1 and a petition to determine if a dog is potentially dangerous or vicious, with
2 supporting documents, to Claire Birgy, with one packet for Plaintiff Claire
3 Birgy and one packet for dog owner Erick Krasnoff.^{3/} Claire Birgy signed
4 the proofs of service for receipt of both service packets, as did Alina
5 Hoffman.^{4/} The packets contained the 89 pages of supporting documents
6 for the Petition.

7
8 * On March 25, 2026, an administrative hearing regarding the dog Bruce
9 was held before administrative hearing officer Dean Phaneuf. Plaintiff
10 Claire Birgy attended and testified as did Jean Marie Webster, the Chief
11 Executive Officer of Plaintiff Santa Paula Animal Rescue Center Inc.^{5/}

12
13 * On March 26, 2026, administrative hearing officer Dean Phaneuf issued
14 an order, on approved Judicial Council form MD-130, in which he
15 determined Bruce to be a vicious dog and ordered Bruce's humane
16 euthanasia.^{6/}

17
18 * On April 6, 2026, Plaintiff Claire Birgy filed a notice of appeal (menacing
19 dog) on Judicial Council form MD-140, from the administrative order dated
20 March 26, 2026.

21
22
23 ^{3/} Plaintiff Claire Birgy was formerly married to dog owner Erick Krasnoff.

24 ^{4/} A copy of both proofs of service signed by Claire Birgy and Alina
Hoffman are attached hereto in Exhibit 2.

25 ^{5/} A copy of the March 25, 2026, administrative hearing zoom video footage,
26 documenting Chief Executive Officer Jean Marie Webster's participation in the
hearing, is available to be submitted to the court if it would assist the court.

27 ^{6/} A true and correct copy of the hearing officer's order is attached hereto as
28 Exhibit 3.

1 * On April 9, 2026, Petitioner Bryan Bray, Field Services Manager of
2 Ventura County Animal Services, filed a petition in Ventura County
3 Superior Court for the appeal hearing noticed for April 15, 2026, with 89
4 pages of supporting documents, a copy of which petition was served upon
5 Plaintiff Claire Birgy's counsel Jeffrey D. Johnsen.

6
7 *On April 15, 2026, an appeal hearing was held before the Hon. Mark S.
8 Borrell in which Plaintiff Claire Birgy appealed the administrative order
9 dated March 26, 2026. Santa Paula Animal Rescue Center, Inc. did not
10 attempt to file any papers in connection with this appeal hearing. Upon the
11 conclusion of the hearing, the Hon. Mark S. Borrell issued an order, on
12 approved judicial council form MD-130, determining Bruce to be a vicious
13 dog and ordered Bruce's humane euthanasia within 30 days.

14
15 * On April 15, 2026, Plaintiff Claire Birgy's counsel Jeffrey D. Johnsen,
16 filed a second notice of appeal (menacing dog) on behalf of Claire Birgy
17 and Erick Krasnoff, and the court set a hearing on that filing before the Hon.
18 Ronda J. McKaig on April 30, 2026.

19
20 * On April 30, 2026, a hearing was held before the Hon. Ronda J. McKaig
21 regarding Plaintiff Claire Birgy's filing of a second appeal. At that hearing
22 Ronda J. McKaig took no action stating the court had no jurisdiction. Santa
23 Paula Animal Rescue Center, Inc. did not attempt to file any papers in
24 connection with this hearing.

25
26 * On May 6, 2026, a hearing was held before the Hon. Mark S. Borrell, on
27 Plaintiff Claire M. Birgy's ex parte application for order clarifying the
28

1 court's order dated April 15, 2026, regarding appealability of order, in
2 which the Hon. Mark Borrell denied a stay of execution of judgement. The
3 Hon. Mark S. Borrell also struck paragraph 8 of his former April 15, 2026
4 order. Santa Paula Animal Rescue Center, Inc. did not attempt to file any
5 papers in connection with this hearing.

6 **CONCLUSION**

7 Plaintiff Claire Birgy has had her due process right to one appeal hearing in
8 Ventura County Superior Court to contest the administrative hearing officer's
9 order determining Bruce to be a vicious dog pursuant to Ventura County
10 Ordinance Code section 4470-6. Ventura County Ordinance Code section 4470-6,
11 subdivision (c), states in pertinent part, "The determination of the court hearing
12 the appeal shall be final and conclusive upon all parties."

13 Plaintiff Santa Paula Animal Rescue Center, Inc.'s Chief Executive Officer
14 Jean Marie Webster was present at the underlying administrative hearing held on
15 March 25, 2026, but failed to file any subsequent papers with the Ventura County
16 Superior Court asserting that the due process rights of Santa Paula Animal Rescue
17 Center, Inc., Bruce's "true" owner, had been violated. Having failed to take
18 earlier available action in state court, Plaintiff Santa Paula Rescue Center, Inc.
19 should not now be permitted to claim good cause for the federal court intervention
20 through request for a grant of an ex parte application for a temporary restraining
21 order and order to show cause re preliminary injunction.

22 ///

23 ///

24 ///

25

26

27

28

1 Defendants County of Ventura and Ventura County Animal Services
2 respectfully request the court to deny the instant application for a temporary
3 restraining order and order to show cause re preliminary injunction.

4
5 TIFFANY N. NORTH
6 County Counsel, County of Ventura

7 Dated: May 14, 2026

8 By *Marina Porche*

9 MARINA PORCHE
10 Assistant County Counsel

11 Attorneys for Defendant County of Ventura
12 and Ventura County Animal Services
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

MD-130

ATTORNEY OR PARTY WITHOUT ATTORNEY: STATE BAR NUMBER: 162809 NAME: Marina Porche FIRM NAME: Assistant County Counsel, County of Ventura STREET ADDRESS: 800 South Victoria Avenue CITY: Ventura STATE: CA ZIP CODE: 93009 TELEPHONE NO.: 805-654-2583 FAX NO.: 805-654-2185 E-MAIL ADDRESS: marina.porche@venturacounty.gov ATTORNEY FOR (name): Bryan Bray, Field Services Manager, County of Ventura Animal Servs.	FOR COURT USE ONLY VENTURA SUPERIOR COURT FILED 04/15/2026 K. Bieker Executive Officer and Clerk <i>Nina Lemos</i> Nina Lemos
COURT OR AGENCY: VENTURA STREET ADDRESS: 800 South Victoria Avenue MAILING ADDRESS: CITY AND ZIP CODE: Ventura 93009 BRANCH NAME: Ventura County Superior Court	
PETITIONER: Bryan Bray, Field Services Manager, County of Ventura Animal Services RESPONDENT: Claire M. Birgy & Erick Krasnoff	
ORDER AFTER HEARING (Menacing Dog)	CASE NUMBER: 2026CUPT063248

The proceeding was heard as follows:

1. a. Date: 4/15/2026 Dept.: 40 Room:
 - b. Judge (name): Mark S. Borrell Hearing officer (name):
 - c. Petitioner present Attorney present (name):
 - d. Respondent present Attorney present (name):
2. Respondent presented evidence as to why the dog should not be declared potentially dangerous or vicious.

THE COURT AGENCY FINDS AND ORDERS

3. The dog is described as follows (briefly describe dog and give license number, if available):
 A842188 "Bruce" 3-year-old, neutered male, German Shepherd mix
4. a. The owner of the dog is (name): Claire M. Birgy & Erick Krasnoff
 b. The keeper of the dog is (name):
5. The dog
 - a. is is not potentially dangerous.
 - b. is is not vicious.
6. a. Potentially dangerous dog
 - (1) The dog shall be properly licensed and vaccinated, and the licensing authority shall include the "potentially dangerous" designation in the dog's registration records.
 - (2) The dog, while on the owner's or keeper's property, shall at all times be kept indoors or in a securely fenced yard from which the dog cannot escape, and into which children cannot trespass. The dog may be off the owner's or keeper's property only if it is restrained by a substantial leash, of appropriate length, and only if it is under the control of a responsible adult.
 - (3) If the dog dies, or is sold, transferred, or permanently removed from the city or county where the owner or keeper resides, the owner shall notify the animal control department of the changed condition and new location of the dog within two working days.
 - (4) Other (specify):
- b. Vicious dog
 - (1) Releasing the dog would create a significant threat to the public health, safety, and welfare (check one):
 - (i) The dog shall be destroyed by the animal control officer.
 - (ii) The following conditions are imposed on the ownership of the dog to protect the public health, safety, and welfare (specify):

(Continued on reverse)

Page 1 of 2

EXHIBIT 1, page 1

Received 04/08/2026

MD-130

PLAINTIFF: Bryan Bray, Field Services Manager, County of Ventura Animal Services	CASE NUMBER: 2026CUPT063248
DEFENDANT: Claire M. Birgy & Erick Krasnoff	

6. b. (continued)

(2) (i) Continued ownership or possession of ANY DOG by the dog's owner or keeper would create a significant threat to the public health, safety, and welfare.

(ii) The owner keeper named in item 4 is prohibited from owning, controlling, or having custody of any dog for a period of (specify): _____ from the date this order becomes final.

(3) The following conditions are imposed on the ownership of the dog (specify):

(4) Other (specify):

VENTURA COUNTY ANIMAL SERVICES

7. **Time to comply.** (Name): _____ must comply with this order in accordance with the time schedule, if any, established by the animal control department or local law enforcement agency, BUT NOT more than 30 days from the date of this order (35 days if this order is mailed to you).

8. **Appeal.** If you disagree with this determination, you may, within five days after you receive this order, appeal the decision to the superior court at (address):

Date: *4-15-24*

[Signature]
(SIGNATURE OF JUDGE OR HEARING OFFICER)

Mark S. Borrell

CLERK'S CERTIFICATE OF MAILING

I certify that I am not a party to this cause and that a copy of the **Order After Hearing (Menacing Dog)** was mailed first class, postage fully prepaid, in a sealed envelope to each person whose name and address is shown below, and that the order was mailed

at (place): _____, California.

on (date): _____ Clerk, by _____, Deputy

<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

EXHIBIT 1, page 2

SUPERIOR COURT OF CALIFORNIA, COUNTY OF VENTURA

Superior Court of California, County of Ventura, Hall of Justice, Department 40

2026CLPT063248

IN THE MATTER OF: MONIGUE CLAIRE BIRGY

May 6, 2026

8:30 AM

Judge: Honorable Mark S. Borrell
Judicial Assistant: Penny Wooff
CSR: None

APPEARANCES:

Jeffrey Dean Johnsen, counsel, present for Respondent(s), Petitioner(s), Appellant(s).

Kavan Jeppson, Assistant County Counsel, is present.

NATURE OF PROCEEDINGS: Ex Parte Application for Order Clarifying Court's Order Dated April 15, 2026 Regarding Appealability of Order

9:05 a.m. Court convenes in this matter.

Matter submitted to the Court with argument.

Respondent requests a stay of execution of judgment.

The Court finds/orders:

The court will modify the 4/15/2026 Order after Hearing striking paragraph 8 in its entirety.

Respondent's request to the stay of execution of judgment is Denied.

Notice is waived.

PETITIONER: RESPONDENT:	Bryan Bray, Field Service Manager Erick Kransoff & Claire Birgy	CASE NUMBER 26-02 A26-075079	MD-109
----------------------------	--	---------------------------------	--------

PROOF OF SERVICE

Petition to Determine If Dog Is Potentially Dangerous or Vicious


Personal Service Certified Mail

Service of the notice on the other party may be made by one of the following ways:

(1) Personally delivering these papers to the other party.

OR

(2) Mailing the papers by certified mail return receipt requested, postage prepaid, mailed to the last known address of the other party.

- At the time of service I was at least 18 years of age and not a party to this legal proceeding.
- I served copies of the following papers in the manner shown below:
 - Papers served: **Petition to Determine If Dog is Potentially Dangerous or Vicious with supporting documents and Notice of Hearing.**
 - Manner of service (check and complete either (1) or (2) below)
 - Personal service.** I personally delivered these papers to the owner or keeper of the dog as follows:
 - Name: Erick Kransoff & Claire Birgy
 - Address where served: *600 Aviation Dr, Camarillo CA 93012* 
 - Date served: *3/12/26*
 - Time served: *3:45 pm*
 - Certified mail return receipt requested.** I deposited these papers in the United States mail, in a sealed envelope with postage fully prepaid. I used certified mail and requested a return receipt. The envelope was addressed and mailed to the owner or keeper of the dog as follows:
 - Name:
 - Address:
 - Date of mailing:
 - Place of mailing (city, state):
 - I am a resident of or employed in the county where the notice was mailed.
- My residence or business address is:

600 Aviation Dr.
Camarillo, CA 93010

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

Date: *3/12/26*

Alina Hoffman

(TYPE OR PRINT NAME OF PERSON WHO SERVED THE NOTICE)



(SIGNATURE OF PERSON WHO SERVED THE NOTICE)

Telephone number of person who served the notice:

805-388-4341

Exhibit 2, page 1

PETITIONER: RESPONDENT:	Bryan Bray, Field Service Manager Erick Kransoff & Claire Birgy	CASE NUMBER: 26-02 A26-075079
----------------------------	--	----------------------------------

PROOF OF SERVICE

Petition to Determine If Dog Is Potentially Dangerous or Vicious

Personal Service Certified Mail

Service of the notice on the other party may be made by one of the following ways:

(1) Personally delivering these papers to the other party.

OR

(2) Mailing the papers by certified mail return receipt requested, postage prepaid, mailed to the last known address of the other party.

1. At the time of service I was at least 18 years of age and **not a party to this legal proceeding.**

2. I served copies of the following papers in the manner shown below:

a. Papers served: **Petition to Determine If Dog is Potentially Dangerous or Vicious with supporting documents and Notice of Hearing.**

b. Manner of service (check and complete either (1) or (2) below)

(1) **Personal service.** I personally delivered these papers to the owner or keeper of the dog as follows:

(a) Name: Erick Kransoff & Claire Birgy

(b) Address where served: *600 Aviation Dr
Camarillo CA 93022*

(c) Date served: *3/12/26*

(d) Time served: *3:43*

(2) **Certified mail return receipt requested.** I deposited these papers in the United States mail, in a sealed envelope with postage fully prepaid. I used certified mail and requested a return receipt. The envelope was addressed and mailed to the owner or keeper of the dog as follows:

(a) Name:

(b) Address:

(c) Date of mailing:

(d) Place of mailing (city, state):

(e) I am a resident of or employed in the county where the notice was mailed.

3. My residence or business address is:

600 Aviation Dr.
Camarillo, CA 93010

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

Date:

3/12/26 Alina Hoffman
(TYPE OR PRINT NAME OF PERSON WHO SERVED THE NOTICE)

[Signature]
(SIGNATURE OF PERSON WHO SERVED THE NOTICE)

Telephone number of person who served the notice: *805-388-4341*

Exhibit 2, page 2

ATTORNEY OR PARTY WITHOUT ATTORNEY: STATE BAR NUMBER: NAME: Bryan Bray, Field Services Manager FIRM NAME: Ventura County Animal Services STREET ADDRESS: 600 Aviation Dr CITY: Camarillo STATE: CA ZIP CODE: 93010 TELEPHONE NO.: 805.383.4717 FAX NO.: E-MAIL ADDRESS: bryan.bray@venturacounty.gov ATTORNEY FOR (name): NA	FOR COURT USE ONLY
COURT OR AGENCY: COUNTY OF VENTURA - ANIMAL SERVICES ("VCAS") STREET ADDRESS: 600 Aviation Dr MAILING ADDRESS: CITY AND ZIP CODE: Camarillo, CA 93010 BRANCH NAME:	
PETITIONER: Bryan Bray, Field Services Manager - VCAS RESPONDENT: Monique Claire Birgy & Erick Krasnoff	
ORDER AFTER HEARING (Menacing Dog)	CASE NUMBER: 26-02 / A26-075079

The proceeding was heard as follows:

1. a. Date: March 24, 2026 Dept.: VCAS Room: via Zoom
 - b. Judge (name): Hearing officer (name): Dean Phaneuf
 - c. Petitioner present Attorney present (name):
 - d. Respondent present Attorney present (name):
2. Respondent presented evidence as to why the dog should not be declared potentially dangerous or vicious.

THE COURT AGENCY FINDS AND ORDERS

3. The dog is described as follows (briefly describe dog and give license number, if available):
 "Bruce," a 2-year-old, male, Great Pyrenees/German Shepherd mix, Animal Number A871620
4. a. The owner of the dog is (name): Monique Claire Birgy & Erick Krasnoff
- b. The keeper of the dog is (name):
5. The dog
 - a. is is not potentially dangerous.
 - b. is is not vicious.
6. a. Potentially dangerous dog
 - (1) The dog shall be properly licensed and vaccinated, and the licensing authority shall include the "potentially dangerous" designation in the dog's registration records.
 - (2) The dog, while on the owner's or keeper's property, shall at all times be kept indoors or in a securely fenced yard from which the dog cannot escape, and into which children cannot trespass. The dog may be off the owner's or keeper's property only if it is restrained by a substantial leash, of appropriate length, and only if it is under the control of a responsible adult.
 - (3) If the dog dies, or is sold, transferred, or permanently removed from the city or county where the owner or keeper resides, the owner shall notify the animal control department of the changed condition and new location of the dog within two working days.
 - (4) Other (specify):
NA
- b. Vicious dog
 - (1) Releasing the dog would create a significant threat to the public health, safety, and welfare (check one):
 - (i) The dog shall be destroyed by the animal control officer.
 - (ii) The following conditions are imposed on the ownership of the dog to protect the public health, safety, and welfare (specify):
NA

(Continued on reverse)

EXHIBIT 3, page 1

MD-130

PLAINTIFF: Bryan Bray, Field Services Manager - VCAS DEFENDANT: Monique Claire Birgy & Erick Krasnoff	CASE NUMBER: 26-02 / A26-075079
--	------------------------------------

6. b. (continued)

- (2) (i) Continued ownership or possession of ANY DOG by the dog's owner or keeper would create a significant threat to the public health, safety, and welfare.
 - (ii) The owner keeper named in item 4 is prohibited from owning, controlling, or having custody of any dog for a period of (specify): three (3) years from the date this order becomes final.
- (3) The following conditions are imposed on the ownership of the dog (specify):
NA
- (4) Other (specify):
NA

- 7. **Time to comply.** (Name): Ms Birgy and Mr. Krasnoff must comply with this order in accordance with the time schedule, if any, established by the animal control department or local law enforcement agency, BUT NOT more than 30 days from the date of this order (35 days if this order is mailed to you).
- 8. **Appeal.** If you disagree with this determination, you may, within five days after you receive this order, appeal the decision to the superior court at (address):
Ventura County Superior Court, Hall of Justice, 800 S Victoria Ave, Ventura, CA 93009

Date: March 26, 2026



(SIGNATURE OF JUDGE OR HEARING OFFICER)

CLERK'S CERTIFICATE OF MAILING

I certify that I am not a party to this cause and that a copy of the **Order After Hearing** (Menacing Dog) was mailed first class, postage fully prepaid, in a sealed envelope to each person whose name and address is shown below, and that the order was mailed

at (place): _____, California.

on (date): _____

Clerk, by _____, Deputy

<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Exhibit 3, page 2

CASE # 26-02 A26-075079

**FINDING/ORDERS
TO BE SERVED A.S.A.P.**

PROOF OF PERSONAL SERVICE

STATE OF CALIFORNIA, COUNTY OF VENTURA

I am not a party to this action; I am a resident of the County aforesaid; I am over the age of eighteen years; and my business address is:

**Ventura County Animal Services
600 Aviation Dr., Camarillo, CA 93010**

On March 26, 2026
(Date)

I personally served the within: Order After Hearing
(Documents or Contents)

on Claire Birgy, Claire Birgy
(Print name of person served) (Signature of person served)

At 600 Aviation Dr
(Address where person served)

Executed on 3/27/, 2026
(Date)

at 600 Aviation Dr Camarillo, California.
(Place)

I declare under penalty of perjury, that the foregoing is true and correct.

X [Signature]
(Officer Signature)