

– DRAFT –

**SUBJECT: Student Citizenship, Discipline for Defiance, Education Code 48900(k)**

To Whom it May Concern,

The Chico Unified School District, its Board of Trustees, teachers, administrators and classified staff, respectfully asks the State Legislature, Superintendent of Public Instruction, and any other applicable regulatory agencies to restore some ability of local education agencies to suspend students for defiance. While well-intended, we believe recent amendments to California's Education Code effectively eliminating suspension for defiance have placed students and staff in danger, and diminished positive school climates in our district.

Amendments to California Education Code section **48900(k)**, which have pointedly undermined the historical authority of school administrators to suspend for defiance, have legally empowered students at all grade levels to verbally and publicly defy, disobey and disrespect any and all authority figures on campus, including teachers, principals and support staff. Traditionally, students who failed to follow basic rules for respecting peers and authority could face disciplinary actions, including but not limited to suspension. Because of the aforementioned changes, however, administrators are severely limited in their ability to discipline students for bad or disruptive behaviors, many of which are truly toxic and encourage further poor behavior and disorder on campuses.

Poor student behavior is a key factor that has contributed to teacher "burnout" in districts throughout the State, and in Chico. A 2022 survey conducted by the California Teachers Association (CTA) and the UCLA Center for the Transformation of Schools found that 32% of teachers, when asked what they like least about their position, "most often mentioned aspects related to student apathy, discipline and behavioral problems."<sup>1</sup> In a handful of instances, the District has had considerable difficulty staffing classrooms for the most challenging students from a behavioral standpoint, especially those with a history of violence towards staff and students. A combination of factors, in the wake of a very destabilizing global pandemic, where loosening standards for student behavior are colliding with an inability on our part to hire and retain staff to grapple with problems as they arise, is making it more and more difficult to find safe and economical solutions.

In a district-wide survey conducted by Chico Unified in late November of this year (2023), fully three-quarters of classified and certificated staff (75.9%) believe that "disruptive student behavior" at their school is either "somewhat unfavorable" (46.6%) or "most unfavorable" (29.3%). When specifically asked whether the phasing-out of Education Code 84900(k), a work in progress since legislation prohibiting suspension for "willful defiance" for grades 9-12 will first

---

<sup>1</sup> "Voices from the Classroom: Developing a Strategy for Teacher Retention and Recruitment," Kai Matthews, PhD., research conducted by Hart Research Associates on behalf of the California Teachers Association and UCLA Center for the Transformation of Schools, September 15, 2022, Page 8.

take effect on January 1, 2024<sup>2</sup>, 36.1% of certificated and classified staff had an “unfavorable” view of the changes, while 16.6% saw them as “somewhat unfavorable.” 14% of staff thought the elimination of 84900(k) is having little to no negative effect, while a substantial 33.4% were “unsure.” When asked the extent to which they agree with the statement “I feel safe at this school” 32.4% agreed strongly, and 50.4% agreed somewhat.

Again, we believe the above-mentioned recent changes have been well-intended, stemming from a desire to deliver quality education equitably and in a manner that upholds the respect for individual students as paramount. We are also optimistic that the modifications need not be abandoned entirely, but rather that by legislation or regulatory changes we might simply be able to ease back on the reins in an appropriate fashion that will better enable us to perform our delicate, all-important task.

Sincerely,

Xxxxxxxxxx

---

<sup>2</sup> SB 274 (Skinner), 2023, extends the sunset for prohibitions on suspension for defiance for grades K-8, and adds a prohibition for grades 9-12.

## **APPENDIX**

### CALIFORNIA EDUCATION CODE SEC. 48900

*[Relevant passages underlined, provisions of (k) have been extended and amended by SB 274 (Skinner, 2023 - Attached)]*

A pupil shall not be suspended from school or recommended for expulsion, unless the superintendent of the school district or the principal of the school in which the pupil is enrolled determines that the pupil has committed an act as defined pursuant to any of subdivisions (a) to (r), inclusive:

- (a)(1) Caused, attempted to cause, or threatened to cause physical injury to another person.
- (2) Willfully used force or violence upon the person of another, except in self-defense.
- (b) Possessed, sold, or otherwise furnished a firearm, knife, explosive, or other dangerous object, unless, in the case of possession of an object of this type, the pupil had obtained written permission to possess the item from a certificated school employee, which is concurred in by the principal or the designee of the principal.
- (c) Unlawfully possessed, used, sold, or otherwise furnished, or been under the influence of, a controlled substance listed in Chapter 2 (commencing with Section 11053) of Division 10 of the Health and Safety Code, an alcoholic beverage, or an intoxicant of any kind.
- (d) Unlawfully offered, arranged, or negotiated to sell a controlled substance listed in Chapter 2 (commencing with Section 11053) of Division 10 of the Health and Safety Code, an alcoholic beverage, or an intoxicant of any kind, and either sold, delivered, or otherwise furnished to a person another liquid, substance, or material and represented the liquid, substance, or material as a controlled substance, alcoholic beverage, or intoxicant.
- (e) Committed or attempted to commit robbery or extortion.
- (f) Caused or attempted to cause damage to school property or private property.
- (g) Stole or attempted to steal school property or private property.
- (h) Possessed or used tobacco, or products containing tobacco or nicotine products, including, but not limited to, cigarettes, cigars, miniature cigars, clove cigarettes, smokeless tobacco, snuff, chew packets, and betel. However, this section does not prohibit the use or possession by a pupil of the pupil's own prescription products.
- (i) Committed an obscene act or engaged in habitual profanity or vulgarity.

(j) Unlawfully possessed or unlawfully offered, arranged, or negotiated to sell drug paraphernalia, as defined in Section 11014.5 of the Health and Safety Code.

(k)(1) Disrupted school activities or otherwise willfully defied the valid authority of supervisors, teachers, administrators, school officials, or other school personnel engaged in the performance of their duties.

(2) Except as provided in Section 48910, a pupil enrolled in kindergarten or any of grades 1 to 3, inclusive, shall not be suspended for any of the acts enumerated in paragraph (1), and those acts shall not constitute grounds for a pupil enrolled in kindergarten or any of grades 1 to 12, inclusive, to be recommended for expulsion. This paragraph is inoperative on July 1, 2020.

(3) Except as provided in Section 48910, commencing July 1, 2020, a pupil enrolled in kindergarten or any of grades 1 to 5, inclusive, shall not be suspended for any of the acts specified in paragraph (1), and those acts shall not constitute grounds for a pupil enrolled in kindergarten or any of grades 1 to 12, inclusive, to be recommended for expulsion.

(4) Except as provided in Section 48910, commencing July 1, 2020, a pupil enrolled in any of grades 6 to 8, inclusive, shall not be suspended for any of the acts specified in paragraph (1). This paragraph is inoperative on July 1, 2025.

(l) Knowingly received stolen school property or private property.

(m) Possessed an imitation firearm. As used in this section, "imitation firearm" means a replica of a firearm that is so substantially similar in physical properties to an existing firearm as to lead a reasonable person to conclude that the replica is a firearm.

(n) Committed or attempted to commit a sexual assault as defined in Section 261, 266c, 286, 287, 288, or 289 of, or former Section 288a of, the Penal Code or committed a sexual battery as defined in Section 243.4 of the Penal Code.

(o) Harassed, threatened, or intimidated a pupil who is a complaining witness or a witness in a school disciplinary proceeding for purposes of either preventing that pupil from being a witness or retaliating against that pupil for being a witness, or both.

(p) Unlawfully offered, arranged to sell, negotiated to sell, or sold the prescription drug Soma.

(q) Engaged in, or attempted to engage in, hazing. For purposes of this subdivision, "hazing" means a method of initiation or preinitiation into a pupil organization or body, whether or not the organization or body is officially recognized by an educational institution, that is likely to cause serious bodily injury or personal degradation or disgrace resulting in physical or mental harm to a former, current, or prospective pupil. For purposes of this subdivision, "hazing" does not include athletic events or school-sanctioned events.

(r) Engaged in an act of bullying. For purposes of this subdivision, the following terms have the following meanings:

(1) "Bullying" means any severe or pervasive physical or verbal act or conduct, including communications made in writing or by means of an electronic act, and including one or more acts committed by a pupil or group of pupils as defined in Section 48900.2, 48900.3, or 48900.4, directed toward one or more pupils that has or can be reasonably predicted to have the effect of one or more of the following:

(A) Placing a reasonable pupil or pupils in fear of harm to that pupil's or those pupils' person or property.

(B) Causing a reasonable pupil to experience a substantially detrimental effect on the pupil's physical or mental health.

(C) Causing a reasonable pupil to experience substantial interference with the pupil's academic performance.

(D) Causing a reasonable pupil to experience substantial interference with the pupil's ability to participate in or benefit from the services, activities, or privileges provided by a school.

(2)(A) "Electronic act" means the creation or transmission originated on or off the schoolsite, by means of an electronic device, including, but not limited to, a telephone, wireless telephone, or other wireless communication device, computer, or pager, of a communication, including, but not limited to, any of the following:

(i) A message, text, sound, video, or image.

(ii) A post on a social network internet website, including, but not limited to:

(I) Posting to or creating a burn page. "Burn page" means an internet website created for the purpose of having one or more of the effects listed in paragraph (1).

(II) Creating a credible impersonation of another actual pupil for the purpose of having one or more of the effects listed in paragraph (1). "Credible impersonation" means to knowingly and without consent impersonate a pupil for the purpose of bullying the pupil and such that another pupil would reasonably believe, or has reasonably believed, that the pupil was or is the pupil who was impersonated.

(III) Creating a false profile for the purpose of having one or more of the effects listed in paragraph (1). "False profile" means a profile of a fictitious pupil or a profile using the likeness or attributes of an actual pupil other than the pupil who created the false profile.

(iii)(I) An act of cyber sexual bullying.

(II) For purposes of this clause, “cyber sexual bullying” means the dissemination of, or the solicitation or incitement to disseminate, a photograph or other visual recording by a pupil to another pupil or to school personnel by means of an electronic act that has or can be reasonably predicted to have one or more of the effects described in subparagraphs (A) to (D), inclusive, of paragraph (1). A photograph or other visual recording, as described in this subclause, shall include the depiction of a nude, semi-nude, or sexually explicit photograph or other visual recording of a minor where the minor is identifiable from the photograph, visual recording, or other electronic act.

(III) For purposes of this clause, “cyber sexual bullying” does not include a depiction, portrayal, or image that has any serious literary, artistic, educational, political, or scientific value or that involves athletic events or school-sanctioned activities.

(B) Notwithstanding paragraph (1) and subparagraph (A), an electronic act shall not constitute pervasive conduct solely on the basis that it has been transmitted on the internet or is currently posted on the internet.

(3) “Reasonable pupil” means a pupil, including, but not limited to, a pupil with exceptional needs, who exercises average care, skill, and judgment in conduct for a person of that age, or for a person of that age with the pupil's exceptional needs.

(s) A pupil shall not be suspended or expelled for any of the acts enumerated in this section unless the act is related to a school activity or school attendance occurring within a school under the jurisdiction of the superintendent of the school district or principal or occurring within any other school district. A pupil may be suspended or expelled for acts that are enumerated in this section and related to a school activity or school attendance that occur at any time, including, but not limited to, any of the following:

(1) While on school grounds.

(2) While going to or coming from school.

(3) During the lunch period whether on or off the campus.

(4) During, or while going to or coming from, a school-sponsored activity.

(t) A pupil who aids or abets, as defined in Section 31 of the Penal Code, the infliction or attempted infliction of physical injury to another person may be subject to suspension, but not expulsion, pursuant to this section, except that a pupil who has been adjudged by a juvenile court to have committed, as an aider and abettor, a crime of physical violence in which the victim suffered great bodily injury or serious bodily injury shall be subject to discipline pursuant to subdivision (a).

(u) As used in this section, “school property” includes, but is not limited to, electronic files and databases.

(v) For a pupil subject to discipline under this section, a superintendent of the school district or principal is encouraged to provide alternatives to suspension or expulsion, using a research-based framework with strategies that improve behavioral and academic outcomes, that are age appropriate and designed to address and correct the pupil's specific misbehavior as specified in Section 48900.5.

(w)(1) It is the intent of the Legislature that alternatives to suspension or expulsion be imposed against a pupil who is truant, tardy, or otherwise absent from school activities.

(2) It is further the intent of the Legislature that the Multi-Tiered System of Supports, which includes restorative justice practices, trauma-informed practices, social and emotional learning, and schoolwide positive behavior interventions and support, may be used to help pupils gain critical social and emotional skills, receive support to help transform trauma-related responses, understand the impact of their actions, and develop meaningful methods for repairing harm to the school community.